Atascadero City Council

Staff Report - Public Works Department

Professional Engineering and Environmental Services for Phase 1 of the Via Avenue and Santa Lucia Road Bridge Replacement Projects

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Council:

1. Authorize the City Manager to execute a contract with Quincy Engineering to provide professional engineering and environmental services for Phase 1 of the Via Avenue Bridge Replacement Project for a fee not to exceed $297,455; and

2. Authorize the City Manager to execute a contract with Quincy Engineering to provide professional engineering and environmental services for Phase 1 of the Santa Lucia Road Bridge Replacement Project for a fee not to exceed $303,906.

REPORT-IN-BRIEF:

The City solicited proposals from qualified consultants for Professional Engineering Services for the Via Avenue and Santa Lucia Road Bridge Replacement Projects. Three proposals were received, reviewed and ranked. The review panel determined Quincy Engineering was clearly the most qualified firm to complete these projects, and has negotiated a final scope and fee for the work.

Both bridge replacements are to be funded as part of the Federal Highway Bridge Replacement and Rehabilitation Program (HBRRP). Santa Lucia Bridge has 100% Federal Cost Participation. The Via Avenue Bridge has 88.53% Federal Cost Participation, with the City responsible for the remaining 11.47% of costs.

The fee proposal from Quincy Engineering exceeds the allocated amount for Preliminary Engineering. Quincy Engineering has lowered the overall fee, and has proposed splitting the work into Phase I (Preliminary Engineering, Environmental Studies and Permitting, Geotechnical Studies, Hydraulic Studies), and Phase II (Final Engineering Design). Splitting the work into Phases will allow the Preliminary Engineering (Phase I) to be completed under the currently allocated funding amount. A

HBRRP Supplemental Funding Request will be prepared and submitted for necessary additional federal funds as the Final Engineering scope is refined over the next year. The process of requesting additional Engineering Services funds is common for Federally Funded Bridge Replacement Projects, and staff has been assured by Caltrans Local Assistance that requests for additional funding are generally always approved.

DISCUSSION:

Background: In 2005, the Santa Lucia Road Bridge (Bridge #49C-0158) and Via Avenue Bridge (Bridge #49C-0164) were identified as needing replacement. The 2013 update of the Caltrans Bridge Inspection Records Information System (BIRIS) identified the Via Avenue Bridge as being structurally deficient and functionally obsolete, and the Santa Lucia Road Bridge as functionally obsolete. This determination allowed for the availability of Federal funding for the replacement of the two bridges. Below is a brief timeline of completed project milestones:

January, 2014: City staff initiates Via Avenue and Santa Lucia Road Bridge replacement projects.

February, 2014: Quincy Engineering is hired to prepare a Project Study Report Equivalent and HBRRP funding application for both bridge replacement projects.

March, 2014: Quincy Engineering completes and submits the Project Study Report Equivalent and Funding Applications. As part of the funding application, Preliminary Engineering, Right-of-Way, Construction Engineering and Construction costs were estimated. Preliminary Engineering (PE) funds were based upon an allowable percentage of estimated construction costs, resulting in an estimated PE cost of $375,000 for both bridge projects. At that time, it was noted that PE costs would likely be higher than the allocated amount, but that the difference could be requested during the design phase.

March-May, 2015: Public Works staff and Caltrans personnel completed field reviews of both locations, and a Preliminary Environmental Study (PES) Report was completed.

June/July, 2015: Public Works staff advertised an RFP for Grant Funding Administration, which was awarded to Kathy Pence of Cannon Corporation.

January, 2016: Public Works staff advertised an RFP for Preliminary Engineering Services.

March, 2016: Preliminary Engineering proposals were received from three firms: Stantec, Hatch Mott MacDonald, and Quincy Engineering.

Proposals were reviewed by Public Works staff and a representative from Caltrans Local Assistance. The review team agreed that Quincy Engineering was clearly the most qualified consultant and negotiated a scope and fee for Preliminary Engineering Services.

Schedule:
The schedule below reflects the major project milestones to date, along with staff's best estimate of the timing of future events.

Feb-Mar, 2014	Quincy Engineering is hired by City and prepares Project Study Report Equivalent and Funding Application.
Mar-May, 2015	City completes site review and prepares Preliminary Environmental Study.
July, 2015	City hires Cannon Corp. (Kathy Pence) for Grant Funding Administration Services.
Jan-Mar, 2016	Public Works staff advertises RFP for Preliminary Engineering Services, and tentatively selects Quincy Engineering as the most qualified consultant.
4/26/2016	Council consider authorizing Phase I (Preliminary Engineering) of contract with Quincy Engineering for: 1. Santa Lucia Road Bridge: ($303,906) 2. Via Avenue Bridge: ($297,455)
Spring 2016-Spring 2017	Preparation of Environmental Documents, Permitting, Hydraulic Studies, Geotechnical Studies, and Preliminary Bridge Engineering.
Spring 2017	Council consider authorization of Phase II (Final Engineering) of contract with Quincy Engineering for an additional (estimated): 1. Santa Lucia Road Bridge: ($296,000) 2. Via Avenue Bridge: ($286,000)
Summer 2017	Council consider authorization of Right-of-Way acquisition (if needed)
Spring 2017-Fall 2018	Preparation of Final Engineering Plans, Specifications and Estimates.
Fall 2018	Council consider awarding necessary construction contracts, and consider whether to construct bridges concurrently or over two years.
Fall 2018-Summer 2019	Replacement of Via Avenue Bridge.
Fall 2019-Summer 2020	Replacement of Santa Lucia Road Bridge.

Analysis: At this time, the City is still within the timeline to hit target dates. Both bridge replacement projects have committed funding through the Federal Bridge Replacement Program, and Quincy Engineering has been selected to complete the Preliminary Engineering Services.

The total fee (Phase I and Phase II) proposal provided by Quincy Engineering exceeds the Preliminary Engineering cost currently approved for both projects. However, City staff reviewed the fee proposal and has determined that it is a reasonable fee given the scope of work. After negotiations with the City, Quincy Engineering lowered the overall fee slightly, and has proposed splitting the work into Phase I (Preliminary Engineering,

Environmental Studies and Permitting, Geotechnical Studies, Hydraulic Studies), and Phase II (Final Engineering Design, Bid Support, Construction Services). Detailed work scopes for both bridges have been provided and are included with this Staff Report for reference.

Splitting the work into Phases will allow the Preliminary Engineering (Phase I) to be completed under the currently allocated funding amount, and a Supplemental Funding Request will be prepared for necessary additional funds as the Final Engineering scope is refined over the next year. The process of requesting additional Engineering Services funds is common for Federally Funded Bridge Replacement Projects, and staff has been assured by Caltrans Local Assistance that requests for additional funding are generally always approved.

It is significant to note that the selection of a qualified consultant is extremely important, with long-term cost and functionality ramifications. While Quincy Engineering provided a fee estimate above that which was preliminarily estimated, their fee proposal justified the costs. It is reasonable to expect that their expertise will ultimately result in an efficient project timeline, decreased City staff administrative hours required, minimized design and construction change orders, and a long-term cost-effective bridge replacement solution.

Finally, it should be noted that the $375,000 funding allocation for Preliminary Engineering includes Grant Funding Administration Services provided by Kathy Pence, as well as staff time to administer the project. The proposed contract amounts for Phase I Engineering Services for Quincy Engineering allow for these additional expenses within the allocated funding.

Conclusion: Staff recommends approving the splitting of bridge design work into two phases, and awarding Phase I to Quincy Engineering. While Quincy Engineering provided a fee estimate above that which was previously estimated and funded, obtaining additional funding is commonplace and the process is clear. Review of the proposals clearly demonstrated that Quincy Engineering is the consultant with the best mix of experience and qualifications to complete this project in a timely, efficient manner, and provide the City with a high quality product and low expected life-cycle costs.

FISCAL IMPACT:

The fiscal impact of the award of the Phase I Engineering and Environmental Services contract for the Santa Lucia Bridge Project is the expenditure of $303,906 in budgeted HBRRP grant funds. The fiscal impact of the award of the Phase I Engineering and Environmental Services contract for the Via Avenue Bridge Project is the expenditure of $263,337 in budgeted HBRRP grant funds and $34,118 in budgeted Local Transportation Funds.

SANTA LUCIA BRIDGE

PROPOSED EXPENDITURES	
Phase I:	
Preliminary Engineering (Preliminary Design, Survey, Environmental Studies and Permitting, Hydraulic Reports, Geotechnical Reports.	$303,906
Design Support (Staff, contingency, grant administration)	69,140
Total Estimated Expenditure:	$373,046

BUDGET	
HBRR Grant Funds	$375,000
Total Funding Sources	$375,000

VIA AVENUE BRIDGE

PROPOSED EXPENDITURES	
Phase I:	
Preliminary Engineering (Preliminary Design, Survey, Environmental Studies and Permitting, Hydraulic Reports, Geotechnical Reports.	$297,455
Design Support (Staff, contingency, grant administration)	68,495
Total Estimated Expenditure:	$365,950

BUDGET	
HBRR Grant Funds	$331,990
Local Transportation Funds	43,010
Total Funding Sources	$375,000

ALTERNATIVES:

1. Council reject staff's recommendation and direct staff to terminate negotiations with Quincy Engineering and begin negotiations with the second-highest ranked consultant. This alternative is not recommended due to the significant difference in qualifications between the top-ranked and second-ranked firm.

2. Council may approve a contract with Quincy Engineering for the combined Phase I & II Engineering Services, and direct staff to begin the Supplemental Budget Request process.

ATTACHMENTS:

None